TOBACCO PRODUCT WASTE PREVENTION AND MITIGATION

August 27, 2020
A cigarette butt can pollute up to 500 liters of water!
SPEAKERS

Dr. Thomas Novotny,
San Diego State University & Cigarette Butt Project

Hudson Kingston,
Staff Attorney, Public Health Law Center

Raquel Fernández Megina,
President of Nofumadores.org

MODERATOR

Laurent Huber
ASH Executive Director
The Tobacco End Game: Joining Tobacco Control and Environmental Advocacy on Tobacco Product Waste
Thomas E. Novotny MD MPH
WWW.CIGWASTE.ORG
Today’s Presentation

• Basic facts on tobacco product waste (TPW) and its environmental burden, including economic burden
• Discuss the ‘Filter Fraud’ and its implications for policy
• Describe tobacco industry response to TPW problem
• Present realistic policy solutions as joint tobacco-control/environmental End Game effort
Cigarette Waste Disposal and Marine Environment

Cigarette butts are the No. 1 littered item on U.S. roadways and the No. 1 item found on beaches and waterways worldwide.
# Top Ten Items Picked Up Over 27 Years of Coastal Cleanup

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item rank</th>
<th>Item</th>
<th>No. of Debris Items</th>
<th>Percentage of Total Debris Items</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>cigarettes/filters</td>
<td>52,907,756</td>
<td>32%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>food wrappers/containers</td>
<td>14,766,533</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>caps, lids</td>
<td>13,585,425</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>cups, plates, forks, knives, spoons</td>
<td>10,112,038</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>beverage bottles (plastic)</td>
<td>9,549,156</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>bags (plastic)</td>
<td>7,825,319</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>beverage bottles (glass)</td>
<td>7,062,199</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>beverage cans</td>
<td>6,753,260</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>straws/stirrers</td>
<td>6,263,453</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>rope</td>
<td>3,251,948</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Top ten total debris items** 132,077,087 80%

**Total debris items worldwide** 166,144,420 100%

Source: Ocean Conservancy, 2011
The cigarette butt itself is toxic when ingested by children or other living organisms.
Hazardous chemicals such as nicotine, ethyl phenol, cadmium, arsenic, and lead in cigarette butts can leach into the environment ➔ Contaminates waterways and land. Some chemicals may bio-accumulate in the food chain and create human health risks.
How much toxic waste is that?

• 5.6 trillion cigarettes smoked each year globally, >4 trillion dumped somewhere each year
• Weight of 20 cigarette filters is 3.4 gm;
• Estimated discarded butt waste from U.S. cigarette consumption (290 billion) in 2011 is about **49.8 million kg**
• Does not include packages, lighters, matches, and other tobacco products (cigars, e-cigs, and smokeless tobacco pouches).
The SDSU Fish Toxicity Study, 2011

Topsmelt- Marine
Fathead Minnow- Freshwater

LC50: 1 butt/L

**Smoked: With Tobacco**

- Saltwater: Topsmelt
- Freshwater: Fathead minnow

![Graph showing the effect of cigarette butt concentration on mean survival. The graph indicates the concentration levels at 0.125, 0.25, 0.5, 1, 2, and 4 cigarette butts per liter, with respective survival rates.]
The Economic Burden of TPW

• *Tobacco Control* 2011: Maximum Permissible Fee per pack sold in San Francisco is 20 cents
• Funded cleanup, administration, public education, etc. as *fee-based* program
• TI lawsuits followed but were successfully defended and litter fee signed into law 2010

• *IJERPH* 2020: TPW cost estimate for 30 largest US cities
• Annual TPW-attributable costs for large US cities: Range US$4.7 to $90 million per year.
• Total TPW cost for all 30 cities combined was US$264.5 million per year.
Cigarette Butts And the Law
(Witkowski, Tulane Env Law Journal, 2014)

• Cigarette Butts are hazardous Waste under California Law
• Generators of hazardous waste must ensure that the wastes are disposed of properly
• Trash Amendment to California Clean Water Act prohibits waste >5mm from storm drains)

• **Failing to warn** smokers of the dangers of cigarette butts to the environment Is a violation of product liability law
• **A public nuisance claim against the tobacco industry** may spur action toward reducing or eliminating the cigarette butt litter problem.
Cigarette Butt Waste: The Filter Fraud

Cigarette filters are made from cellulose acetate: photo-degradable, not bio-degradable.

Although ultraviolet rays from sun eventually break down filters, source material never disappears.
THE FILTER FRAUD: DEBUNKING THE MYTH OF “SAFER”

Major health organizations promoted “less hazardous” cigarette because most people would not or could not stop smoking.

Major medical journals (JAMA, NEJM, BMJ, Lancet) accepted cigarette advertising into the 1950s.

Smoking filtered cigarettes provides NO health protection
Filters Are a Health Risk, Not Health Protection

• **2001 Natl. Cancer Institute, Monograph 13:**
  “Epidemiological and other scientific evidence...does not indicate a benefit to public health from changes in cigarette design and manufacturing over the last fifty years.”

• **2014 US Surgeon General’s Report:** “The evidence is sufficient to conclude that the increased risk of adenocarcinoma of the lung in smokers results from changes in the design and composition of cigarettes since the 1950s.”

• **Novotny et al, Curr Env Health Rep 2014:** Filters make it easier to smoke, to inhale more deeply, and to defraud the smoker into thinking he/she is doing ‘something’ to prevent cancer.
Lung Adenocarcinoma Incidence Increases, 1970-2010

Source: Song et al., J Nat Cancer Institute 2017
The Industry’s Response: Corporate Social Responsibility vs. Producer Responsibility

- Educate smokers (‘accommodation’)
- Pocket ashtrays
- Provide outdoor ashtrays and receptacles
- Sponsor anti-litter campaigns
- Avoid ANY producer responsibility
- Biodegradable filters were tried and are not marketable: they would likely increase butt flicking
PMI Launches “Our World Is Not an Ashtray” Initiative Aims to Halve Plastic Litter from Products by 2025*

- 25% of adult smokers reported they throw butts on the ground because they “think it is a normal way to dispose of a cigarette.”
- 75% thought that cigarette filters are made of cotton or paper; 13% thought made of plastic
- Working with NGOs again: — Litterati, Cortexia, and CARTO to mobilize ‘volunteers’
- Make cigarette butt littering socially unacceptable
- Increase scale and reach of volunteer participation in clean-up activities,
  “Nudge smokers to more responsible disposal habits, launching general population education programs, and cooperating with governments and local authorities to ensure there is an adequate waste disposal infrastructure.”

*Business Wire July 16, 2020
Policy Initiatives to Prevent and Mitigate TPW
www.cigwaste.org

• Raise public awareness of plastic pollution, lack of health benefit, environmental and economic burden of TPW
• Join with environmental advocacy groups to address problem with local jurisdictions
• Ban sale of filtered cigarettes
• Assess litter fees on cigarettes sold in local jurisdiction to recover costs of cleanup
• Litigation by governments, NGOs, and businesses to address public nuisance and economic costs of TPW on the environment
ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE, NOVEL TOBACCO PRODUCTS, AND HAZARDOUS WASTE
LEGAL TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE

- Legal Research
- Policy Development, Implementation, Defense
- Publications
- Trainings
- Direct Representation
- Lobby
AGENDA

1. What is Environmental Justice (EJ)?

2. How do tobacco products cause environmental harm in EJ communities?

3. FDA’s EJ duties, and opportunities to engage with FDA environmental review.

4. Local policy options to promote EJ.
ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE
FOUNDING

TOXIC WASTES AND RACE
In The United States

A National Report on the Racial and Socio-Economic Characteristics of Communities with Hazardous Waste Sites

Credit: United Church of Christ
ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE
FOUNDING PRINCIPLES


WE, THE PEOPLE OF COLOR, gathered together at this multinational People of Color Environmental Leadership Summit, to begin to build a national and international movement of all peoples of color to fight the destruction and taking of our lands and communities, do hereby re-establish our spiritual interdependence to the sacredness of our Mother Earth; to respect and celebrate each of our cultures, languages and beliefs about the natural world and our roles in healing ourselves; to ensure environmental justice; to promote economic alternatives which would contribute to the development of environmentally safe livelihoods; and, to secure our political, economic and cultural liberation that has been denied for over 500 years of colonization and oppression, resulting in the poisoning of our communities and land and the genocide of our peoples, do affirm and adopt these Principles of Environmental Justice:

The Principles of Environmental Justice (EJ)

1) Environmental Justice affirms the sacredness of Mother Earth, ecological unity and the interdependence of all species, and the right to be free from ecological destruction.
2) Environmental Justice demands that public policy be based on mutual respect and justice for all peoples, free from any form of discrimination or bias.
3) Environmental Justice mandates the right to ethical, balanced and responsible uses of land and renewable resources in the interest of a sustainable planet for humans and other living things.
4) Environmental Justice calls for universal protection from nuclear testing, extraction, production and disposal of toxic/hazardous wastes and poisons and nuclear testing that threatens the fundamental right to clean air, land, water, and food.
5) Environmental Justice affirms the fundamental right to political, economic, cultural and environmental self-determination of all peoples.
6) Environmental Justice demands the cessation of the production of all toxic, hazardous wastes, and radioactive...
ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE
FOUNDING PRINCIPLES


6) Environmental Justice demands the cessation of the production of all toxins, hazardous wastes, and radioactive materials, and that all past and current producers be held strictly accountable to the people for detoxification and the containment at the point of production.
ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE
FOUNDING PRINCIPLES


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Principle</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6) Environmental Justice</td>
<td>demands the cessation of the production of all toxins, hazardous wastes, and radioactive materials, and that all past and current producers be held strictly accountable to the people for detoxification and the containment at the point of production.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14) Environmental Justice</td>
<td>opposes the destructive operations of multi-national corporations.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

WE, THE PEOPLE OF COLOR, gathered together at this multinational People of Color Environmental Leadership Summit to begin to build a national and international movement of all peoples of color to fight the destruction and taking of the Earth to ourselves; to demand for over of our environmental acts, public, private, and the United Nations Conventions on the Environments. |

11) Environmental Justice must recognize a special legal and natural relationship of Native Peoples to the U.S. government through treaties, agreements, compacts, and covenants affirming sovereignty and self-determination. |

12) Environmental Justice affirms the need for urban and rural ecological policies to clean up and rebuild our cities and rural areas in balance with nature, honing the cultural integrity of all our communities, and provided fair access for all to the full range of resources. |

13) Environmental Justice calls for the strict enforcement of principles of informed consent, and a halt to the testing of experimental reproductive and medical procedures and vaccinations on people of color. |

14) Environmental Justice opposes the destructive operations of multi-national corporations. |

15) Environmental Justice opposes military occupation, repression and exploitation of lands, peoples and cultures,
ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE
FOUNDING PRINCIPLES


14) Environmental Justice opposes the destructive operations of multi-national corporations.

6) Environmental Justice demands the cessation of the production of all toxins, hazardous wastes, and radioactive materials, and that all past and current producers be held strictly accountable to the people for detoxification and the containment at the point of production.

17) Environmental Justice requires that we, as individuals, make personal and consumer choices to consume as little of Mother Earth's resources and to produce as little waste as possible; and make the conscious decision to challenge and reprioritize our lifestyles to ensure the health of the natural world for present and future generations.
ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE
EXECUTIVE ORDER 12,898

Credit: William J. Clinton Presidential Library, GSU
2012 Environmental Justice Strategy and Implementation Plan

FEBRUARY 2012
THE ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACTS OF TOBACCO GROWING, CURING, AND MANUFACTURING

• Deforestation (biodiversity loss/habitat destruction)
• Pesticide Overuse and Contamination
• Child Labor
• Decreased Food and Water Security
• Climate Change Emissions
• Mismanaged Industrial Waste
E-CIGARETTES AND HEATED CIGARETTES

[Diagram of e-cigarette components showing cartomizer, atomizer, battery, cartridge, atomizer, battery, clearomizer, drip tip, tank system, IQOS components, detail holder, detail heat stick, detail charger, and source: PMP 2017.]
THE FULL COST OF E-CIGARETTES
MORE RESOURCES EXTRACTED, MOSTLY ABROAD

Economics
Vaping Puts a Choke Hold on the Last of America's Tobacco Farms

By Jeremy Hill
January 24, 2019, 9:49 AM CST

- E-cigarettes use cheaper crops from countries like Zimbabwe
- With tobacco acreage at a Civil War-low, farmers seek options
THE FULL COST OF E-CIGARETTES
MINING AND PROCESSING WASTE
E-CIGARETTES HAZARDOUS WASTE?

Resource Conservation and Recovery Act (RCRA)

- EPA Regulations in 1980:
  - Nicotine on the original list of acute hazardous wastes
  - “Acute hazardous waste” = deadly or very harmful in small doses
E-CIGARETTES
HAZARDOUS WASTE!

UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20460

MAY 08 2015

Daniel K. DeWitt
Warner, Norcross & Judd LLP
900 Fifth Third Center
111 Lyon Street, N.W.,
Grand Rapids, MI 49503-2487

Dear Mr. DeWitt:

Thank you for your letter of March 12, 2014, requesting EPA's determination regarding the hazardous waste status of e-cigarettes under the Resource Conservation and Recovery Act (RCRA). After reviewing your letter, the Agency has concluded that because e-cigarettes include cartridges that are containers of a commercial chemical product, specifically nicotine, e-cigarettes therefore may be regulated as acute hazardous waste P075 when disposed.

Nicotine as the Sole Active Ingredient of E-Liquids
reviewing your letter, the Agency has concluded that because e-cigarettes include cartridges that are containers of a commercial chemical product, specifically nicotine, e-cigarettes therefore may be regulated as acute hazardous waste P075 when disposed.
E-CIGARETTES
HAZARDOUS WASTE!

“. . . the evidence is clear that nicotine is still acutely toxic to both humans and animals under the RCRA hazardous waste regulations and must continue to be listed as acute hazardous waste . . . .”


E-CIGARETTES
HAZARDOUS WASTE!

“. . . without controls on the concentration of nicotine in e-cigarettes and e-liquids or FDA’s approval of these products as being safe and effective for people to use. . . . the Agency cannot support exempting e-cigarettes and nicotine-containing e-liquids from the . . . listing.”

E-CIGARETTES
HAZARDOUS WASTE BATTERIES

Photo credit: T.E.A.M.
E-CIGARETTES – 5TH GENERATION DISPOSABLES
HAZARDOUS WASTE MIXTURE

Photo by Jeremiah Mock taken September 15, 2019 at a public high school in Marin County.
E-Cigarettes, Tobacco and Cannabis Products Are Littering High Schools

UCSF Garbology Study Finds Environmental Hazard at Bay Area High Schools Due to Increased Youth Vaping and Smoking

By Elizabeth Fernandez

Cigarette butts collected at one Bay Area high school's student parking lots on one day. Credit: Kazuyoshi Fujita and Jeremiah Mock.

JUUL pods, caps, and packaging collected at one Bay Area high school's student parking lots on one day. Credit: Kazuyoshi Fujita.
STATE AND LOCAL ACTION
HAZARDOUS WASTE GUIDANCE

VAPING IS HAZARDOUS FOR THE ENVIRONMENT

Did you know?
- Vaping exposes communities to toxic substances.
- Vaping is linked to a number of health issues.
- Vaping is a public health crisis.
- Vaping can cause respiratory problems.
- Vaping can cause cancer.
- Vaping can cause heart disease.
- Vaping can cause stroke.
- Vaping can cause addiction.
- Vaping can cause death.

VAPE AWARE
Your environment - Your responsibility
Bocco.org/VapeAware

EL VAPEO ES PELIGROSO PARA EL MEDIO AMBIENTE

¿Sabías?
- El vapeo es una adicción que puede ser mortal.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades pulmonares.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades cardíacas.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades cerebrales.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades reproductivas.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema endocrino.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema nervioso.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema hidro-vascular.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema inmunitario.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema digestivo.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema reproductivo.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema circulatorio.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema nervioso.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema digestivo.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema reproductivo.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema circulatorio.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema nervioso.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema digestivo.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema reproductivo.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema circulatorio.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema nervioso.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema digestivo.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema reproductivo.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema circulatorio.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema nervioso.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema digestivo.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema reproductivo.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema circulatorio.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema nervioso.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema digestivo.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema reproductivo.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema circulatorio.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema nervioso.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema digestivo.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema reproductivo.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema circulatorio.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema nervioso.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema digestivo.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema reproductivo.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema circulatorio.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema nervioso.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema digestivo.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema reproductivo.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema circulatorio.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema nervioso.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema digestivo.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema reproductivo.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema circulatorio.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema nervioso.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema digestivo.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema reproductivo.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema circulatorio.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema nervioso.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema digestivo.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema reproductivo.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema circulatorio.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema nervioso.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema digestivo.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema reproductivo.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema circulatorio.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema nervioso.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema digestivo.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema reproductivo.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema circulatorio.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema nervioso.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema digestivo.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema reproductivo.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema circulatorio.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema nervioso.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema digestivo.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema reproductivo.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema circulatorio.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema nervioso.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema digestivo.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema reproductivo.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema circulatorio.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema nervioso.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema digestivo.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema reproductivo.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema circulatorio.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema nervioso.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema digestivo.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema reproductivo.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema circulatorio.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema nervioso.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema digestivo.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema reproductivo.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema circulatorio.
- El vapeo puede causar enfermedades del sistema nervioso.
TOBACCO PRODUCT POLLUTION
FDA OVERSIGHT?

National Environmental Policy Act of 1970 (NEPA):
• Requires every federal agency to assess the potential for significant environmental impacts of major federal actions
• Authorization of “new tobacco products” and other applications under the Tobacco Control Act are major federal actions
• FDA has conducted hundreds of environmental reviews of tobacco products since 2014
• FDA is subject to both HHS and CEQ guidance on EJ, and the EJ executive order 12,898
TOBACCO PRODUCT POLLUTION
FDA OVERSIGHT?

ENVIRONMENTAL CONSIDERATIONS FOR TOBACCO PRODUCT APPLICATIONS SUBMITTED TO CTP

Presented by
Cristi Stark, M.S.
Associate Director for Science Policy
Office of Science, CTP, FDA

August 2016
TOBACCO PRODUCT POLLUTION
FDA OVERSIGHT?

FDA ACTIONS SUBJECT TO NEPA

- Promulgation of new regulations
- Requests for private action
  - Market authorizations* for product applications

*Also applies to denials of authorizations which have a CatEx
TOBACCO PRODUCT POLLUTION
FDA OVERSIGHT

For example, September 2019 assessment of RJ Reynolds cigarettes:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Programmatic Environmental Assessment for Marketing Orders for New Cigarettes Manufactured by R.J. Reynolds Tobacco Company</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Prepared by Center for Tobacco Products</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>U.S. Food and Drug Administration</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

September 27, 2019
For example, September 2019 assessment of RJ Reynolds cigarettes:
TOBACCO PRODUCT POLLUTION
FDA OVERSIGHT

FDA’s entire EJ analysis in September 2019 assessment of RJ Reynolds cigarettes:

6.3. Environmental Justice

No new emissions are expected due to use of the new products. Therefore, there would be no disproportionate impacts on minority or low-income populations.
TOBACCO PRODUCT POLLUTION
FDA OVERSIGHT

But see the IQOS analysis:

3.4 Environmental Justice

Executive Order 12898 requires federal agencies to identify and address, as appropriate, disproportionately high and adverse human health or environmental effects of programs, policies, and activities on minority populations and low-income populations.

3.4.1 Affected Environment

The new products could be used and disposed of nationwide under the proposed actions. Minority and low-income populations throughout the United States are the affected environment for environmental justice.

3.4.2 Potential Impacts from Proposed Actions

3.4.2.1 Use

Because the new products consist of heating and inhaling a tobacco product, there is an inherent human health impact from their use. Section 3.5.2 discusses the significance in terms of NEPA of this human health impact. This section addresses whether the health impact would disproportionately affect minority or low-income populations.
THE TOBACCO PRODUCT LIFE CYCLE
FDA OVERSIGHT

Credit: Zafeiridou et al.
FEDERAL POLICY LEVERS
FDA OVERSIGHT OF PRODUCT AUTHORIZATIONS

Things to remember about NEPA and FDA:

• *Every* new tobacco product will have to undergo NEPA review, and the agency must consider comments it receives
  – As FDA commences e-cigarette review this September (under a court order), advocates can submit comments on how the products impact the environment and Environmental Justice

• FDA’s compliance with NEPA has evolved over time, could improve with more community involvement/criticism of weak reviews

• Without an adequate environmental review under NEPA, *none of these products could be legally authorized for marketing*
  – Lawsuits against inadequate NEPA analyses by other agencies frequently stop projects that are not in the public interest
LOCAL POLICY SOLUTIONS FOR TOBACCO WASTE
BEST DEVELOPED WITH EJ PARTNERS

1. Sales restrictions
2. Hazardous waste enforcement, cost shifting
3. Public nuisance litigation or regulation
POLICY SOLUTIONS
SALES RESTRICTIONS

• Likely the best option for public health and the environment.
• Would need to prohibit the products that lead to tobacco product waste (or prohibit the sale of all tobacco products to address the many upstream impacts).
• Following the example of flavored product prohibitions in US, EU, Canada, Brazil…

Photo credit: Lindsay Fox, EcigaretteReviewed.com
**Compliance:** Colorado example – [statewide guidance](#) on correct practices for schools.

**Education:** Boulder County example – paired public health and hazardous waste expertise to create messaging around the dangers of e-cigarette pollution, importance of proper disposal.

**Cost shifting:** States have primary authority over hazardous waste enforcement—likely could find ways to pass costs back to responsible parties. For example:

- Fees for retailers that sell certain products.
- Some states have a bottle/can deposit 5 or 10 cents. Could fashion an e-cigarette deposit to encourage return to retailer for responsible disposal.
POLICY SOLUTIONS
PUBLIC NUISANCE

Litigation:
• Lawsuits against JUUL by:
  – NC; NY; MN; CA; DC; AZ; PA; MA; NM; IL
  – Over 100 school districts

• States have applicable nuisance laws:
  – Nebraska prohibits “the corrupting or rendering unwholesome or impure of any watercourse…”

Regulation:
State statutes and city ordinances can declare something a “nuisance” and open more legal remedies to address it.
CONTACT US

651.290.7506
publichealthlawcenter@mitchellhamline.edu
www.publichealthlawcenter.org
@phealthlawctr
facebook.com/publichealthlawcenter
SPAIN: SMOKE-FREE BEACHES CAMPAIGN

By Raquel Fernández Megina. President of Nofumadores.org
Why did Nofumadores.org chose the campaign Smoke-free beaches among others?:

► Spain has 8,000kms (almost 5,000 miles) of coastline and lives off tourism, which is why its beaches must have the highest quality.

► Beaches do not have private owners. Although they are administered by the cities and the government, they ARE owned by everyone. Therefore, we will not encounter direct opposition from an specific person or entity.

► There were already a number of smoke-free beaches.

► City Councils like this measure because it lowers the cost of cleaning the beach.

► Making a stand for smoke-free beaches means having the support of environmental groups and a large part of the population, especially young people, who are more concerned with these issues than they may be with public health ones.
What we could get with this campaign. What was our objective. What did we pursue?

1. Raise visibility of the problem
2. Increase social awareness
3. Encourage greater demand for smoke-free spaces
4. Facilitate for the government expanding the ban to create other similar outdoor smoke-free spaces (such as swimming pools, national parks, etc.)
What is the scenario in Spain prior to launching our campaign?

- Spain’s mainland, being a peninsula, has over 3,000 beaches
- In 2006, L’Escala, in Calalunia, was the first beach in Spain to be declared smoke-free
- In 2012, the Galician municipality of Baiona copied from New York the idea of healthy and ecological sandbanks, banning smoke on 2 of its beaches. In 2014, two more beaches joined the initiative, which brought up the total of smoke-free beaches in Spain to 15 (0.5%), including some in the Canary Islands and Catalonia too
- By 2018, the number of the smoke-free beaches had increased to 91 (3%)
Actions taken. Chronology

► **August 2018:** we launched the change.org campaign Smoke-free beaches

https://www.change.org/p/que-todas-las-playas-espa%C3%B1olas-sean-espacios-libres-de-humo-de-tabaco
August 2018: we launched the campaign in English, looking for international support. This was the logical move, as tourism has become the sector that contributes most wealth to the Spanish economy. It represents 14.6% of GDP in addition to 2.8 million jobs and 83.7 million tourists, of which a large percentage visit our beaches.

Make All Spanish Beaches Smoke-Free

https://www.change.org/p/make-all-spanish-beaches-smoke-free
Actions taken. Chronology

**October 2018:** we delivered 128,000 signatures to the General Director and Deputy Director of Public Health of the Ministry of Health

- We were congratulated on the proposal and told that these types of campaigns help the Ministry when it comes to implementing these types of measures, since politicians need social support in order to change the laws

- The main message we were given was:

  **Make noise. Help us to help you.**
Actions taken. Chronology

► **May 30, 2020:** on the occasion of World No Tobacco Day, Nofumadores.org delivers almost 230,000 signatures of the Smoke-Free Beaches campaign. Due to the COVID-19 pandemic and the state of alarm, this was done virtually.

This time the signatures were delivered to:

► The Minister of Health
► The Minister of Ecological Transition
► The President of Spain
May 27, 2020: email sent to 55 coastal City Councils, requesting that they urgently present a proposal at their plenary sessions to declare all beaches smoke-free in their municipality
Results

► The Ministry received our initiative with enthusiasm and informs us that these initiatives help them promote these type of measurements

► On May 9, 2019 the Public Health Commission of the Interterritorial Council, approves its 2019-20 Lines of Action in the Field of Tobacco Prevention and Control:

Advances in regulation:

Promote the expansion of smoke-free spaces to other outdoor spaces, such as sports and leisure centers or private vehicles, among others, and support good practice initiatives such as "smoke-free beaches", or the "network of smoke-free health centers"
June 8, 2020: reply from the Director of the Cabinet of the Presidency of the Government

Madrid, 8 de junio de 2020

Sra. Dª. Raquel Fernández Megina
Presidenta de Nofumadores.org
Malacanán, 23
28002 MADRID

Estimada Sra. Fernández:

Me dirijo a usted nuevamente para dar respuesta al escrito que ha remitido al Presidente del Gobierno, mediante el que le hace llegar las más de 220,000 firmas que su organización ha recogido a través de la plataforma Charge.org, en apoyo a la solicitud de modificación de la Ley 28/2005, de 26 de diciembre, con el objeto de que se defina todas las playas de España como espacios libres de humo de tabaco.

A este respecto, le reiteramos nuestro agradecimiento por hacernos partícipes de la iniciativa llevada a cabo por Nofumadores.org y de esta propuesta, que contribuiría a reducir la contaminación de nuestras playas y costas, al tiempo que evitaría la exposición pasiva al humo de tabaco en nuestras playas.

En este sentido, tenemos la confianza en que tanto el Ministerio de Sanidad como la Vicepresidenta cuarta y Ministra para la Transición Ecológica y el Reto Demográfico, a los que han hecho llegar también esta iniciativa, tendrán en consideración sus propuestas.

Aprovecho la ocasión para enviarle un cordial saludo,
June 12, 2020: The Minister of Health informed us in written that they will **work alongside the Ministry of Ecological Transition on the smoke-free beaches initiative**... after having analyzed the three proposed measures presented by your entity, I inform you that I have instructed my team to jointly explore together with the Ministry for Ecological Transition and Demographic Challenge the possibility of promoting, improving or expanding the current networks of Smoke-free in order that our coasts are spaces free of smoke and cigarette butts.
Results

- Social support is very high and keeps growing.

About 90 percent of those surveyed consider "smoke-free beaches" to be good or very good.

74.1 percent of citizens believe that smoking should be banned on beaches and terraces.
Results

► Every summer the number of beaches that join smoke-free beach programs increases considerably, a sign of citizen support that encourages coastal City Councils to implement them.

► By 2020, the number of the smoke-free beaches has increased to 475 (15.83%)

Mijas will have two smoke-free beaches to promote healthy habits

- También afectará a los que utilicen otros dispositivos para el consumo de tabaco como cigarrillos electrónicos y cachimbas
The Popular Party proposes a smoking ban on Cangas’ beaches

February 27th, 2020
San Roque is considering joining a program that bans smoking on beaches
A Coruña’s city council will ask bathers not to smoke on its beaches this summer.
El Campello bans smoking on all of its beaches

El municipio se adhiere a la Red Playas Sin Humo de la Generalitat. La iniciativa no tiene carácter sancionador e incluye campañas de concienciación. Las colillas son un problema de contaminación y de contagio del virus

June 12th, 2020

El Campello prohíbe fumar en todas sus playas
No smoking: the beaches of Cádiz with smoke-free areas this summer

VIVIR EN CÁDIZ

El Palmar cuenta con una zona libre de humo / MANUEL ARAGÓN PINA

Results

No smoking: the beaches of Cádiz with smoke-free areas this summer

Cádiz será la provincia con más zonas sin humo en sus playas. El Consejero de Salud y Familia, Jesús Aguirre, presentó esta semana en Conil esta iniciativa de la Junta que este año logra más adeptos. El verano pasado, Vejer, con su kilómetro libre de humo, fue el municipio pionero y esta vez playas de Conil, Tarifa, Barbate y La Línea se apuntan.

Así, los arenales que contarán con zonas sin humo en Cádiz son los siguientes:

- El Chorrito en Conil
- El Palmar en Vejer
- Playa Chica, Atlanterra, Valdevaqueros, Lances, Bolonia en Tarifa
- El Carmen y Zahara de los Atunes en Barbate

Además, la playa interior de Zahara de la Sierra, Arroyomolinos, también tendrá una zona delimitada donde no se podrá fumar.
Results

El Carabassí, first smoke-free beach in Elche

El alcalde, Carlos González, y la secretaria autonómica de Salud Pública, Isaura Navarro, izan la bandera "Platges sense fum" en el arenal para concienciar a los usuarios de los perjuicios que causa el tabaco.

Make Carabassí beach (Elche) a tobacco smoke-free space

1,905 personas han firmado. ¡Ayuda a conseguir 2,500!

Carabassí sin humos ha iniciado esta petición dirigida a Carlos González Serna Alcalde de Elche y 1 otro/a

El Carabassí, la primera playa de Elche libre de humo

04.08.2020 | 14:44 | Redacción | El August 4th, 2020
SPAIN: SMOKE-FREE OUTDOOR SPACES IN CORONAVIRUS TIMES LATEST NEWS

nofumadores.org
MANIFEST TO URGE THE SPANISH GOVERNMENT TO DECLARE OUTDOOR HOSPITALITY INDUSTRY SPACES SMOKE AND VAPOR-FREE

SMOKE-FREE TERRACES NOW!
Smoke-free outdoor spaces in coronavirus times

Galicia bans smoking on the street or in terraces if safety distance cannot be guaranteed

Núñez Feijóo ha anunciado la sorprendente medida, que entra en vigor desde este mismo jueves.

August 12th, 2020
Smoke-free outdoor spaces in coronavirus times

AGREEMENT BETWEEN HEALTH MINISTRY AND ALL THE REGIONAL GOVERNMENTS

Nightlife venues closed down and smoking banned on the street all over Spain

Sanidad ha pactado con las CCAA cerrar los locales de ocio nocturno; reforzar el control de botellones en vía pública; y prohibir en toda España fumar cuando no se pueda mantener la distancia.

August 14th, 2020
Smoke-free outdoor spaces in coronavirus times

Health Authorities materializes the project 'Smoke-free beaches' by banning smoking in the sands of Cantabria

August 23th, 2020

La Consejería de Sanidad destaca este domingo que ha hecho realidad el proyecto de 'Playas sin humo' que desde la Dirección General de Salud Pública se viene impulsando en los últimos años, con la publicación de la resolución que prohíbe fumar en las playas como medida para prevenir el contagio del coronavirus.

Este proyecto de 'Playas sin humo', puesto en marcha con la resolución publicada el pasado sábado 15 de agosto en el Boletín Oficial de Cantabria (BOC) y que a primeros de mes se presentó a los alcaldes de los municipios costeros de Cantabria con buena acogida, tiene como objetivo que las playas y zonas de baño sean verdaderos espacios de disfrute, convivencia, respeto mutuo, ocio saludable y contacto con la naturaleza.

En un comunicado, la directora general de Salud Pública, Paloma Navas, ha explicado que la limitación del tabaco en la costa tiene un doble objetivo, centrado por un lado en la mejora de los hábitos saludables y en evitar que los fumadores pasivos estén sometidos al humo y, por otro lado, en mejorar la calidad de la arena y del agua.
Smoke-free outdoor spaces in coronavirus times

Stop smoking on the terraces: the coronavirus drives a giant step in the public health strategy against tobacco

"We already asked for it before the pandemic, but now the situation has worsened and it’s become more evident," says Fernández Megina, "because COVID-19 pandemic has been added to the tobacco pandemic." The hope is "that it stays." But the spokeswoman for Nofumadores.org goes further and sees the measure as "a first step; good but insufficient."

"What we hope is that it be decreed as a ban, because now it is not; you can still smoke if you are two meters apart. And that actually complicates things for the terraces managers, who are the ones who have to deal with the conflict," she says.

The platform supports this type of policy because its objective is to "denormalize tobacco consumption. Regardless of it being legal, even its manufacturers admit it damages health and kills. And now it also increases the risk of contracting COVID-19. In a country where people socialize at restaurants and bars, banning smoke in outdoor terraces is key to denormalizing consumption in general."
Smoke-free outdoor spaces in coronavirus times

Balearic Islands bans smoking in the street, reduces capacity and closes beaches at night

La presidenta del Govern, Francina Armengol, y la consellera Patricia Gómez comparecen tras la reunión con los presidentes y presidentas de los consells insulares, así como con el presidente de la FELIB y el alcalde de Palma para abordar temas relacionados con el control de la pandemia del coronavirus.

Entre las medidas adoptadas, Armengol ha anunciado que se prohibirá fumar en Baleares en cualquier espacio público sin tener en cuenta la distancia entre las personas, las playas y parque se cerrarán por la noche y la obligatoriedad de llevar mascarilla se extiende a los paseos marítimos y a centros de trabajo, aunque con excepciones en este último caso.

August 26th, 2020
THANK YOU

Raquel Fernández Megina
President of Nofumadores.org

informacion@nofumadores.org
www.nofumadores.org
@nofumadores/twitter.com/nofumadores
facebook.com/nofumadores.org
Q&A
Stay Involved

Twitter @ASHorg @LaurentHuber

Facebook @ASHglobalAction

Instagram @ASHorg

Email Info@ash.org

NEXT WEBINAR: September 10th at 12:00pm ET

Addressing Cessation in Priority Populations

Speakers: Martin Raw (Director of the International Centre for Tobacco Cessation and Visiting Professor at New York University School of Global Public Health); Rachel Smolowitz and Michael Stavros (Sheppard Pratt Hospital); and Carolyn Dresler, MD, MPA (ASH Volunteer).

Registration Link in Thank You Email

Recordings from previous webinars and Live Chats on social media: https://ash.org/webinars

Toolkit for Advocates

Talking with government and media about the COVID-19 and tobacco use co-morbidity and policies to protect the health of everyone during the pandemic.

ash.org/covid19